BOSTON WOMEN’S WORKFORCE COUNCIL REPORT 2016

A partnership between Mayor Martin J. Walsh and the Boston Business community to make Boston the premier place for working women.
I. INTRODUCTION

II. ACTIONS AND FINDINGS
   Recruitment
   Reporting & Data Analysis
   Reporting Process
   Data Analysis

III. BEST PRACTICES: WHAT EMPLOYERS ARE DOING
   Lessons from the Best Practices Conference
   Sponsor Insights

IV. GOING FORWARD: 2017

V. BOSTON 100% TALENT COMPACT SIGNERS
January 2017

Dear Signers of the 100% Talent Compact,

When I first took office in 2014 I pledged to listen, learn and lead. It quickly became clear that leading on gender equity was essential to our City’s success. Not only is it the right thing to do, it is important to our economy as a whole and businesses’ bottom lines. Women make up the majority of our city, but like every city and most companies in the nation, women -- and especially women of color -- are underrepresented and underpaid in our workforce. To lead we had to listen and learn from real data and business leaders.

We had two options: ignore the gender wage gap and hope it goes away over time (data tells us that we will reach equity by the year 2152) or do something about it.

For us, there never really was a choice. We had to act, and thanks to the 180 businesses represented in this report, we are leading to make Boston the premier place for working women.

Over the past few years we have relied on your expertise, your experiences, and your data to inform this first-of-its-kind report. Our data and unique approach to sharing best practices provide a model for the Nation.

I want to thank all of the businesses that have shown leadership and committed to our Compact, especially our lead sponsors: Massachusetts Mutual Life Insurance Company, Partners HealthCare, Putnam Investments, State Street, and Vertex Pharmaceuticals. Their time, financial resources, and commitment make this report possible.

Thank you to our academic partners: Simmons College for hosting us; the Rafik B. Hariri Institute for Computing and Computational Science & Engineering at Boston University, our data partner in this effort; and the Women and Public Policy Program at the Harvard Kennedy School for funding and assisting with our data analysis.

Finally, I want to acknowledge the tireless efforts of our co-chairs Cathy Minehan and Evelyn Murphy and the entire Boston Women’s Workforce Council. Their leadership has been essential to the success of our work. I am grateful for their time, energy and invaluable expertise.

This is more than just a report. This is government, business, and academia coming together to solve one of the greatest challenges of our time. As we have said time and time again: It is 2017. It’s time we stop talking about the gender wage gap and start doing something about it.

This report is the first of many steps we will take towards action to finally achieve gender parity in the workplace and make Boston the premier place for working women. We are grateful to all who made it possible.

With Gratitude,

Martin J. Walsh, Mayor of Boston
January 2017

Dear Signers of the Boston 100% Talent Compact,

As Co-Chairs of the Boston Women’s Workforce Council, it has been our pleasure to work with Mayor Walsh and Megan Costello, the City’s Executive Director for Women’s Advancement, and with all of you on achieving the goals of the Boston 100% Talent Compact.

Despite the progress that women have made in every level of endeavor, gender equity remains a goal rather than an achievement. Boston should be, the best city in the U.S. for working women; it needs to be given the number of women in its workforce, the fact that women are in many cases the primary family breadwinners, and the reality that if Boston businesses are to be successful, they need to make the most of every ounce of their talent.

We have been joined in our enthusiasm for meeting this goal by you, the signers of the Compact. We are especially grateful to you for funding the work of the Council, and for participating in our reporting and Best Practices efforts during the year. The Hariri Institute at Boston University and Simmons College also deserve our thanks for the technology and office support that they provided. We are committed to making our Council work serve your needs as employers, recognizing that if you are successful in closing the wage gap, the city, its families and all of us will be enriched.

Thank you for your commitment and support.

Sincerely,

Cathy Minehan & Evelyn Murphy
BWWC Co-Chairs
THE BOSTON WOMEN’S WORKFORCE COUNCIL MEMBERS

COUNCIL CO-CHAIRS

CATHY MINEHAN  EVELYN MURPHY

COUNCIL MEMBERS

EDDIE AHMED  DANA BORN  LISA BROTHERS  VICTORIA BUDSON

MEGAN COSTELLO  JANE EDMONDS  RITA GERMAN  ELIZABETH HOENSHEID
I. INTRODUCTION

2016 was a very productive year for the Boston Women’s Workforce Council (BWWC). Formed in 2013 to make Greater Boston the best place in the U.S. for working women by closing the gender wage gap, the Council immediately became a top priority for Mayor Walsh in the first days of his administration. The Mayor personally rededicated this effort in March 2016. Many Boston-area businesses joined the Council and the Mayor in the work this year, making the envisioned public-private partnership to address the wage gap a unique Boston reality.

By the end of the year, more than 175 businesses in Greater Boston signed the Boston 100% Talent Compact, which commits them to the goals of the BWWC. Moreover, the BWWC collected actual wage data from 69 companies earlier this year. This represented a first ever totally confidential reporting of such data aimed at providing an average wage gap as a baseline against which to measure progress for the city. Finally, the BWWC hosted an extremely productive Best Practices Conference, bringing over 200 business and nonprofit leaders together to share experiences about what strategies they have tried and implemented in their efforts to close the wage gap.

This report brings together the findings of each of these efforts, and presents data from both the confidential reporting and the Best Practices Conference. Perhaps most importantly, this report also includes the first-person experiences of several Compact signers as they address the issues they have found in closing the wage gap. Our approach to this work is unique. Never before has a city used real employer wage data to assess the pay gap. We have paired this innovative data collection with the leadership of companies to capture real snapshots of the experience of women in the workplace.

The BWWC would like to thank our Lead Sponsors for their generous support: Massachusetts Mutual Life Insurance Company, Partners HealthCare, Putnam Investments, State Street, and Vertex Pharmaceuticals. We are also grateful to our partner Simmons College for hosting us, as well to the Rafik B. Hariri Institute for Computing and Computational Science & Engineering at Boston University, our data partner in this effort. We are grateful to the Women and Public Policy Program at the Harvard Kennedy School for funding and assisting with our data analysis through the work of Heather Milkiewicz and Jessica Kahlenberg. Finally, we’d like to thank McKinsey & Company for providing expert facilitators for our annual Best Practices Conference. We’d also like to thank Executive Director MaryRose Mazzola. This report -- and our work in general -- is only possible thanks to the help of our invaluable partnerships, which recognize this is both the right thing to do and important to Boston’s economy as a whole.
“Moreover, the BWWC collected actual wage data from 69 companies earlier this year. This represented a first ever totally confidential reporting of such data aimed at providing an average wage gap as a baseline, against which to measure progress for the city.”
“We recognize that building a sustainable pipeline of female talent for leadership positions is critical to addressing the wage gap over the long term.”

– ALISON QUIRK,
CHIEF HUMAN RESOURCES AND CITIZENSHIP OFFICER,
STATE STREET CORPORATION
See full testimonial on page 29

“We have a longstanding commitment to making sure our employees are compensated fairly for their work, and that salary differences are based on role, performance and merit alone.”

– EDDIE AHMED
CHIEF HUMAN RESOURCES OFFICER,
MASSMUTUAL FINANCIAL GROUP
See full testimonial on page 26
II. ACTIONS AND FINDINGS

RECRUITMENT
At the beginning of 2016, a total of 55 employers had signed the Compact, including the five Lead Sponsors. Our goal was to add significantly to the number of Compact signers, with a goal to triple the number of signers by year end. We are pleased to report that we met this goal. Integral to this recruitment effort was the addition of several new members to the Council itself, appointed by Mayor Walsh. The Council is currently comprised of 27 members who are leaders in the Greater Boston business community representing the private and nonprofit sectors.

REPORTING AND DATA ANALYSIS
With results reflecting over 10% of the working population of the Greater Boston areas included, the baseline wage gap for the area was calculated at 23 cents -- that is for every dollar earned by men in the sample, women earned 77 cents.

This is a larger gap than has been estimated before, but as discussed more fully below, this data needs to be taken in context. It reflects a first time report of actual wage data by employers, and is drawn from a sample that is not representative of the working population of the areas surveyed. Furthermore, the data itself reflects some human error that has hampered creating a few of the derivative wage gap calculations. In the aggregate, about 7% of overall salaries were not included in the data by race, creating a significant variance with the data by job classification. We are confident in the salaries reported by job classification but not in the wage data by race. However, it is a baseline from which to move forward.

REPORT PROCESS
Working with the staff of the Hariri Institute, including Boston University Software & Application Innovation Lab interns and software engineers, we developed a completely confidential reporting system. The essence of this system is that actual wage data is never revealed outside of the company to which it relates. Rather, disguised averages are computed for each demographic category and aggregated across all companies using a technique known as secure multi-party computation, which means the BWWC receives anonymous, aggregated

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TABLE 1: OVERALL COMPENSATION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>FEMALE</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL ANNUAL COMPENSATION (IN $)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LENGTH OF SERVICE (YEARS)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
“Putnam Investments is proud to have been an original signatory of the Boston 100% Talent Compact and a Lead Sponsor of the Boston Women’s Workforce Council, which is bringing tremendous leadership in addressing the gender wage-gap issue head-on through organizing some of the city’s largest and most influential employers.”

– ROBERT L. REYNOLDS
PRESIDENT AND CEO,
PUTNAM INVESTMENTS

See full testimonial on page 34
The data collected from employers was limited to a set of zip codes that defined the Greater Boston area for reporting purposes. We also asked for cash bonus information and an indication of the average seniority of the workers to provide additional background.

In addition to the collection of wage data, with the help of U.S. Equal Economic Opportunity Commission (EEOC) staff, a unique data set of employee information was created drawn from EEO-1 filings from the Boston area zip codes used for reporting purposes. This was very useful in analyzing the data reported by businesses. With the help of the EEOC information, we could assess the degree to which the demographics of our reported sample matched the whole of the subsection of the labor market we targeted.

It is very important to note that our reporting process asked employers to give us actual wage data. This differs from any other estimates that have been made of wage gaps in that they have relied on wage information reported by employees as individuals. This makes our data set and findings both not comparable to others, and arguably approaching a greater level of accuracy at least as this process is repeated over time.

**DATA ANALYSIS**

We collected data regarding 112,600 employees, which represents 11% of the Greater Boston workforce, as described by the zip codes we chose. This sample reflects a significant economic force in the city; these workers earned almost $11 billion last year, with women in total taking home as much as all the men in the sample. Women’s share of $5.5 billion is largely concentrated in three categories. Thirty-four thousand women professionals earned $3 billion, with an average salary of $82,000. Women in administrative and support positions earned an average salary of $44,000, accounting for $1 billion, while women service workers earned $36,000 on average, taking home an aggregate of $600 million.

**TABLE 2: OVERALL PARTICIPATION BY RACE/ETHNICITY**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ETHNIC GROUPS</th>
<th>OUR SAMPLE</th>
<th>GREATER BOSTON WORKFORCE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>77,683</td>
<td>742,344</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ALL OTHER RACES</td>
<td>2,810</td>
<td>15,520</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASIAN</td>
<td>7,651</td>
<td>91,393</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BLACK/AFRICAN AMERICAN</td>
<td>13,002</td>
<td>104,022</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HISPANIC/LATINO</td>
<td>11,483</td>
<td>79,272</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WHITE</td>
<td>77,683</td>
<td>742,344</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ETHNIC GROUPS</th>
<th>OUR SAMPLE</th>
<th>GREATER BOSTON WORKFORCE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ALL OTHER RACES</td>
<td>2,810</td>
<td>15,520</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASIAN</td>
<td>7,651</td>
<td>91,393</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BLACK/AFRICAN AMERICAN</td>
<td>13,002</td>
<td>104,022</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HISPANIC/LATINO</td>
<td>11,483</td>
<td>79,272</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WHITE</td>
<td>77,683</td>
<td>742,344</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
“We collected data regarding 112,600 employees, which represents 11% of the Greater Boston Work force and almost $11 billion in annual earnings.”
However, our sample was not representative of the demographics of the labor force as a whole. First and foremost, it included a greater proportion of women employees overall—58% women versus 42% men—while the market, as described by the EEOC data, is about evenly split between the two genders. Men and women in our sample are not engaged proportionately in the same job categories as in the workforce as a whole (see Table 4 on page 16), with the possible effect of skewing average salaries for men and women differently than is the case for the market as a whole. One possibility is that given the fact that women on average make less than men, the larger percentage of women in our sample, and the relatively larger number of women in professional positions, results in a gap that is larger than that for the whole population.

Indeed, the willingness of the participants to join the Compact and share data could be an indication of the fact that they have more women in their workforce than average for the Greater Boston area. This data anomaly should correct itself in future reporting cycles as the number of reporting companies increases and the sample itself is more fully representative of the business area as a whole.

Men in our sample receive a larger share of their compensation in cash bonuses (12% of total pay) than do women (5%). Women took home an average cash bonus of $4,000, while men earned $11,000. This gap in bonus pay was most marked in performance bonuses at the executive level, with men earning $300,000 in performance pay on average, and women $82,000. There were also noteworthy gaps between mid-level men and women and professional men and women. We collected data about length of service as well. Male workers had a slightly longer time at their company than women, though again that varied by job classification.

Finally, while racial demographic data were part of the collection process, we have not included racial gender wage gaps in this analysis for the simple reason that we believe those data are not accurate. With every new data collection protocol, glitches occur. Our data collection process ensures anonymity -- we do not know which companies

### Table 3: Compensation Comparisons by Gender Within Job Category

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Job Category</th>
<th>Total Annual Comp (Female/Male Ratio)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Executives</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Midlevel</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professionals</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technicians</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sales Workers</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Admin Support Workers</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Craft Workers</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Operatives</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Laborers and Helpers</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service Workers</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

15
have reported and we do not have data by individual reporter. As a result, we are unable to confer with participating employers who may have unintentionally omitted data. In the aggregate, about 7% of overall salaries were not included in the data by race, creating a significant variance with the data by job classification. We are confident in the salaries reported by job classification but not in the wage data by race.

We recognize that most studies find that the wage gap is significantly worse for women of color. We are disappointed that there was a data glitch that does not allow us to confirm these studies with our unique actual wage data, but this is a top priority for the BWWC and Mayor Walsh because we recognize the intersectionality between gender and race. This is something we will be focused on in 2017 going forward as it is critical to our mission and work.

Gaps exist both in wages and in what level women are employed within a company. We know based on our sample that women make up over 50% of the workforce, but understanding whether those women are entry level or in leadership positions is important as we look at not just wage gaps but overall gender equity. BWWC data as reflected in

**TABLE 4: PROPORTION OF EMPLOYEES BY GENDER**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>FEMALE</th>
<th>MALE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>OUR SAMPLE</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Executive</td>
<td>40.49% (647)</td>
<td>59.51% (951)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mid Level</td>
<td>54.24% (6,803)</td>
<td>45.76% (7,259)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professionals</td>
<td>58.32% (34,180)</td>
<td>41.68% (24,424)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technicians</td>
<td>56.32% (3,049)</td>
<td>43.68% (2,365)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sales Workers</td>
<td>36.17% (522)</td>
<td>63.83% (921)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Administrative Support Workers</td>
<td>78.29% (13,593)</td>
<td>21.71% (3,769)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Craft Workers</td>
<td></td>
<td>97.41% (1,277)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Operatives</td>
<td></td>
<td>89.97% (296)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Laborers and Helpers</td>
<td>19.58% (83)</td>
<td>80.42% (341)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service Workers</td>
<td>43.88% (4,512)</td>
<td>56.12% (5,770)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>GREATER BOSTON WORKFORCE</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Executive</td>
<td>29.39% (6,870)</td>
<td>70.61% (16,507)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mid Level</td>
<td>41.78% (51,045)</td>
<td>58.22% (71,133)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professionals</td>
<td>52.73% (176,023)</td>
<td>47.27% (157,796)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technicians</td>
<td>49.75% (27,306)</td>
<td>50.25% (27,578)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sales Workers</td>
<td>49.02% (53,177)</td>
<td>50.98% (55,311)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Administrative Support Workers</td>
<td>76.30% (90,250)</td>
<td>23.70% (28,040)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Craft Workers</td>
<td></td>
<td>89.86% (27,747)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Operatives</td>
<td>22.51% (10,995)</td>
<td>77.49% (37,853)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Laborers and Helpers</td>
<td>29.82% (10,130)</td>
<td>70.18% (23,844)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service Workers</td>
<td>55.96% (88,311)</td>
<td>44.04% (69,505)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
“Understanding whether women are entry level or in leadership positions is important as we look at not just wage gaps but overall gender equity.”
our charts show that women in general are not well represented in the executive levels. Moreover, the representation gap for women of color in the higher level job categories is significant. Data provided by the EEOC confirm that this representation gap both for women in general, and especially for women of color, is wide for higher level job categories in the labor market as a whole. This is a matter on which we intend to focus the work of the BWWC going forward.

Given the unique characteristics of both our process and the data itself, what does the data say about the wage gap in the Greater Boston area? As noted earlier, the wage gap is 23 cents, with average annual salary compensation within our sample at $103,155 for men and $78,954 for women. Certain job levels have much smaller wage gaps, particularly among female administrative support workers who earn a 3-cent premium on every dollar men earn.

In sum, while the wage gaps we have calculated vary from those done in other ways, we believe that the 23-cent gap overall represents a conservative cornerstone for assessing progress toward wage equity. As more signers of the Compact report their data and the data become more reflective of the area as a whole, and as the reporting glitches are resolved, we look forward to reporting great progress in closing the wage gap here in Boston.

**TABLE 5: FEMALE/MALE LENGTH OF SERVICE COMPARISONS BY JOB CATEGORY**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Job Category</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SERVICE WORKERS</td>
<td>0.72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LABORERS AND HELPERS</td>
<td>1.08</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OPERATIVES</td>
<td>0.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CRAFT WORKERS</td>
<td>0.81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ADMIN SUPPORT WORKERS</td>
<td>1.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SALES WORKERS</td>
<td>1.19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TECHNICIANS</td>
<td>0.84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PROFESSIONALS</td>
<td>1.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MIDLEVEL</td>
<td>1.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EXECUTIVE</td>
<td>0.9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### TABLE 6: CAREER BREAKDOWN BY RACE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CAREER</th>
<th>DATA</th>
<th>ASIAN</th>
<th>ALL OTHER RACES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>EXEC &amp; MID LEVEL</td>
<td>OUR SAMPLE</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>GREATER BOSTON WORKFORCE</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PROFESSIONALS</td>
<td>OUR SAMPLE</td>
<td>7%</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>GREATER BOSTON WORKFORCE</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TECHNICIANS, ADMINs &amp; SALES</td>
<td>OUR SAMPLE</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>GREATER BOSTON WORKFORCE</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OPERATIVES, CRAFT WORKERS, LABORERS AND HELPERS &amp; SERVICE WORKERS</td>
<td>OUR SAMPLE</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>GREATER BOSTON WORKFORCE</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### ETHNIC GROUP

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CAREER</th>
<th>DATA</th>
<th>HISPANIC/LATINO</th>
<th>BLACK/AFRICAN AMERICAN</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>EXEC &amp; MID LEVEL</td>
<td>OUR SAMPLE</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>GREATER BOSTON WORKFORCE</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PROFESSIONALS</td>
<td>OUR SAMPLE</td>
<td></td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>GREATER BOSTON WORKFORCE</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TECHNICIANS, ADMINs &amp; SALES</td>
<td>OUR SAMPLE</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>GREATER BOSTON WORKFORCE</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OPERATIVES, CRAFT WORKERS, LABORERS AND HELPERS &amp; SERVICE WORKERS</td>
<td>OUR SAMPLE</td>
<td>7%</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>GREATER BOSTON WORKFORCE</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
“We have distilled the comments from these discussions around four areas key to attacking the wage gap: creating internal goals, filling the pipeline and creating role models, being transparent, and providing workplace flexibility.”
The second annual Best Practices Conference sponsored by the BWWC on September 30, 2016 was an exciting gathering of over 200 business and nonprofit leaders. Many were CEOs of their organizations; of these, 20 chaired table discussions around a common set of questions facilitated by staff from McKinsey & Co. working on a pro bono basis. The Conference began with Mayor Walsh emphasizing the significance of this groundbreaking work and laying out ambitious goals for the years ahead to achieve gender and racial parity. Ending the Conference with an uplifting keynote speech was Shari Slate, the Chief Inclusion and Collaboration Officer from Cisco Systems.

The organizations present at the Conference all recognized themselves as leaders. They also recognized that there was much more to be done. They expressed their commitment in various ways, with the following thoughts shared by many:

In our business, our focus is the return on the investment bottom line. Our initiative reflects the fact that we see that signing the Compact and working for gender equity has a good business purpose. It was important for us to step back, look at our organization and get commitment from the President. We did a full review of our organization. We looked at all jobs. We made adjustments. Not all of the adjustments were for women. Going forward, the challenge is to keep on track as people get promoted to ensure that they are compensated comparably both internally and externally.

The table discussions yielded many insights into the thinking of the companies present on the challenges of achieving the goals of the Boston 100% Talent Compact. To begin, many expressed frustration at the seeming intractability of the gender wage gap, with comments like it is more than a glass ceiling -- it is a cement one. Differences in various industries were also noted, with some emphasis on the perceived difficulty of women making progress in financial services, tech, and other industries, though many noted that the issue is common in most if not all endeavors.
“With the gender wage gap even larger for women of color, it is especially critical to our mission that we lift up multicultural women and help businesses build work environments where diverse women can thrive.”

– CAROL FULP
PRESIDENT AND CEO OF THE PARTNERSHIP, INC.
See full testimonial on page 33

“We place great value on having a diverse work force that reflects the communities and patients we serve, and endeavor to have broad representation of gender, race, and ethnicity.”

– DR. THOMAS LYNCH
CEO OF MASSACHUSETTS GENERAL PHYSICIANS ORGANIZATION
See full testimonial on page 28
LESSONS FROM THE BEST PRACTICES CONFERENCE

I. CREATE INTERNAL GOALS
There was agreement that much of the effort toward wage equity could be placed in the context of “activity, not productivity” -- well-intentioned but not part of the incentive or performance structure of the organization. Enough initiatives, but few results. The work associated with the Compact, and on diversity initiatives more generally should not be just a report in a drawer. Wage equity initiatives should be subject to internal goal setting, with consequences for not making targets in larger organizational areas. And there was some push back on counting programs such as formal mentoring efforts, with participants questioning if they were worth it. Sponsorship, which involves advocating for the employee not simply counseling them, was discussed as something that might be measured as to its effectiveness.

II. BUILD THE PIPELINE AND CREATE ROLE MODELS
It was recognized that for gender equity to be achieved, a willingness to hire women at entry levels as well as promote them to senior levels was needed. These efforts are tightly coupled. If many women are hired, but none see that there is promise in the field due to the lack of women in senior positions, then much of the work in recruitment is for naught. Similarly, there has to be a good pipeline of qualified women from which to choose in order for progress up the line to be achieved. Many commented that some industries are harder for women to achieve promotion in than others -- construction management and technology were mentioned, for example. But all participants said that inclusion is just plain hard work. Some saw women hollowed out in the middle of the business, with plenty at the bottom and some at the top particularly in board positions.

Some thoughts on best practices were for CEOs to set the tone at the top, require that a diverse group of applicants be presented for every position, and to continually ask why there is not more diversity in the company.

III. PRIORITIZE COMPENSATION TRANSPARENCY
The issue of transparency in compensation was a common theme in table discussions. Without transparency there is no accountability. There was a shared belief in the necessity to benchmark key positions and to compensate all who held those positions fairly based on the benchmark data.

*We have ranges for all our jobs; each has a minimum and a maximum. Everyone in a job should be on the range. You need to commit to what you value in a job, and you need to pay for that value. I’ve had pushback before, but if the person is eligible for the job and we agreed, the job at a minimum is worth this much and that is what we pay them.*

Performance pay equity was cited as something to watch carefully as it is as much as 40% of total compensation in some industries. Many believed that compensation transparency had a big effect not just on pay but on performance as well, saying the more you allow people to see what gets rewarded the clearer it is about what needs to be done to move up. Many commented on how hard it is to talk about pay, and about the need for salary negotiation workshops not just for women but for everyone. And many noted that the new Massachusetts pay equity law will prohibit asking applicants for their pay history. Some wondered what the impact of that restriction will be.
IV. PROVIDE WORKPLACE FLEXIBILITY

While many noted that workplace flexibility had been in place in many companies for years, the real problem was that it was seen not as a broad benefit. To be effective, flexibility had to apply to everyone. You want to get to the point where people have flexibility, and feel comfortable. It’s not just children, its people dealing with elderly parents, other things, whatever the challenges are. You have to look at all different aspects. It’s about creating the right culture. That’s what does it.

These four Best Practices are supported by large bodies of research. However, the real value of the table discussions at the BWWC Best Practices Conference was not so much groundbreaking insights, but the fact that so many were engaged in seeking answers to the wage gap problem that the Boston 100% Talent Compact was developed to address. With their concerns, and their commitment, the Compact signers seem set on the road to solving the difficult underlying problems that have made the wage gap a major employment issue for at least the 40+ years since the signing of the first federal equal pay legislation.
“We work to be part of the solution. We want to continue to learn from best practices so that we are an attractive employer to talented women and so that more women enter the financial services fields.”

– ROBERT RIVERS
PRESIDENT AND CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER,
EASTERN BANK
See full testimonial on page 32

“...It is a business imperative for Partners to ensure that its workplace is both equitable and diverse”

– JOSEPH CABRAL,
CHIEF HUMAN RESOURCES OFFICER,
PARTNERS HEALTHCARE SYSTEM
See full testimonial on page 30
MassMutual was founded more than 165 years ago to help people secure their future and protect the ones they love. We remain committed to that noble purpose today and we still believe community is bigger, better and stronger than any one individual.

That’s also why caring about closing the gender wage gap and ensuring it doesn’t exist at our company isn’t even a question for MassMutual: it is simply the right thing to do.

We have a longstanding commitment to making sure our employees are compensated fairly for their work, and that salary differences are based on role, performance and merit alone. We set high standards for ourselves and have practices in place to not only attract top talent but also create a diverse, fair and inclusive workplace where everyone can achieve their career goals. Some examples of these practices include:

- Actively pursuing workforce and Board of Director diversity.
- Providing our employees with resources and support, from company programs that develop them through mentoring, exposure and advancement opportunities to policies that promote flexibility and work life balance.
- Instituting a mandate for diverse candidate slates AND a diverse, and cross functional, panel of interviewers to create a more transparent and objective selection process
- Exploring technology solutions that circumvent any human biases in the selection of candidates
- Partnering with external experts to analyze and, as needed, address any gender-based salary discrepancies on an annual basis

These efforts have resulted in some great successes to date. For example, approximately half of MassMutual’s Board of Directors are either women or people of color, making it one of the most diverse groups in the industry and among FORTUNE® 500 companies.

And we’re proud to extend our support and development of women into the community. For example, last year we announced a partnership with Mount Holyoke College and Smith College – both established leaders in educating women – to pilot the MassMutual Women in Data Science program. This groundbreaking higher education initiative is aimed at creating a strong pipeline of qualified women professionals in the rapidly growing field of data science and related subjects.

Investing in female talent and ensuring fair and equal pay is also an essential element of a successful business model. By valuing people for who they are, how they think and what they bring to the table, we’ve become a stronger, more innovative company.

We were honored to sign The Boston Women’s Compact, publicly demonstrating our commitment to closing the gender pay gap and standing with other companies that share our belief that gender should not impact compensation. I look forward to a time when we don’t need compacts to address this type of issue and it is just a natural way of conducting business.
MASCO is committed to pay equity for all its employees. We pay each employee based on a position's value in the marketplace. Each year, we review and ensure that our pay practices reward performance based on both marketplace data and merit. A compensation committee of MASCO’s board approves general parameters.

An internal committee, composed of the CEO, CFO, Counsel and Director of Human Resources, evaluates our compensation program for internal equity. This process is to ensure similar positions are grouped together and compensated in a similar manner regardless of gender. We also regularly engage compensation consultants to complete independent pay analyses to confirm industry competitiveness. If these evaluations surface notable pay variances between the market pay and our pay, we take appropriate steps to rectify the situation in accordance with our compensation philosophy.

In addition to ensuring pay equity for our employees, MASCO works to attract and retain employees by offering an extensive benefits package, which is an important part of our total compensation philosophy. We offer access to benefits such as onsite child care, a wellness room available for nursing mothers, flexible work schedules and work-at-home opportunities. These types of benefits have allowed us to retain employees, especially parents, both male and female, for a long time. We also believe that fun is an important component of the work environment for everyone.

MASCO continually monitors pay practices to strive for pay equity, and we have experienced positive results from our efforts.
As the chairman and CEO of the Massachusetts General Physicians Organization (MGPO), I am proud to lead the more than 2,700 physicians (42 percent women) who work at MGH. The MGPO is the largest multi-specialty physician group practice in New England and one of the largest in the US, and so we are committed to making sure we pay our physicians for what they do, not who they are. Being able to participate in the Annual Best Practice Conference was an enriching opportunity to meet other business leaders and learn about strategies to help close the wage gap for women. I am certain that we have advanced the goal of gender pay equity by meeting together as a group of leaders who are highly committed to understanding the factors that affect women’s pay.

At the MGPO and across Partners HealthCare we have a strong commitment to equal pay for equal work across the spectrum of our workforce. This is a particular interest of the MGPO as it relates to how we pay women physicians who now account for more than 50% of medical school graduates. On a regular basis, our compensation committee and leaders carefully review physician compensation. We work closely with our chiefs of service to assess the data and ensure fairness. Being an academic medical center (AMC) means we need to be aware of all the variables that can affect compensation, such as specialty, academic rank, gender, part-time status, and others. Being an AMC also means we have the tools and resources for in-depth research, and we have a team looking closely at these variables with the aim to publish our findings to share knowledge.

Other best practices include ensuring that we have transparent compensation plans in place for all departments, and that our physicians know how they are being paid for their clinical, academic, and research activities. We send each physician an annual personalized compensation report that includes base salary, bonuses, retirement contributions, and the value of benefits such as health and malpractice insurance. We also survey our physicians every other year and include questions about compensation.

We place great value on having a diverse workforce that reflects the communities and patients we serve, and endeavor to have broad representation of gender, race, and ethnicity. An important piece of this work is equal pay for women, and we enthusiastically support this initiative.
Alison Quirk,  
Chief Human Resources and Citizenship Officer,  
State Street Corporation

Being an inaugural signatory of the 100% Talent Compact is important to us because an essential part of State Street’s corporate identity is building and engaging a diverse workforce and inclusive culture. We continue to be actively involved with the Women’s Workforce Council and a staunch supporter of the Compact, as we believe the Council is a great example of the power of public-private partnerships to address important challenges.

We recognize that building a sustainable pipeline of female talent for leadership positions is critical to addressing the wage gap over the long term. We believe that continuous measurement and reporting are keys to success, and have established clear targets to increase the diversity of our leadership ranks. This will ensure that we are building the diverse pipeline we need for our future success with representation of women in our highest paying jobs. In addition, State Street’s commitment to flexible work arrangements is a strong component of our overall retention strategy.

State Street has invested in a diversity sourcing team, dedicated to recruiting diverse talent and customized solutions to each of our business areas. To further improve the fairness of our hiring process, a majority of our recruiting team has attended in-depth unconscious bias training to understand the role that implicit bias can play in hiring and learn about ways to mitigate the unintended consequences of unconscious bias.

Continued participation in the Compact underscores our commitment to working to address the root causes of wage disparity in Boston. We believe that participating in the data collection process for the Compact will help us and other companies identify the interventions that will have the greatest impact on addressing wage disparity. Our focus on building a diverse workforce and inclusive culture demonstrates that we respect and value all our employees and want to see them achieve their full potential. We know that our differences make us stronger, and our diverse ideas and perspectives have a measurable impact on our company’s performance.
Joseph Cabral,
Chief Human Resources Officer, Partners HealthCare System

Partners HealthCare System (Partners) is the largest private employer in Massachusetts – with tens of thousands of employees, 72% of which are female. As such, it is a business imperative for Partners to ensure that its workplace is both equitable and diverse. Partners invests most (66%) of its resources in its people.

Partners has a long history of providing our workforce with strong wage and rich benefit packages across our member hospitals. Over 80% of our employees are eligible to participate in benefits. Our commitment to market competitive total rewards (compensation and benefits) for all of our employees provide real value and are internally transparent. Throughout the enterprise, Partners offers career advancement opportunities, forums, and leadership training opportunities for women.

Over a decade ago, Partners established a Wage Floor program which provided higher than both the federal and minimum hourly wage rates to our employees. As a result of this program, when Partners implemented a $15/hour minimum wage policy in 2016, 95% of our employees were already paid above the minimum. A wage floor benefits employees in a transparent and equitable manner across all of Partners including those who are female, ethnically diverse, employed either full or part time.

Partners has also led in equitably compensating its female physicians. While national research has shown that male physicians out earn females, our hospitals have developed specialty specific compensation plans based upon fair, transparent and clear metrics. As proof that compensation plans promote equity, Massachusetts General Hospital developed a multivariable regression model that measured the drivers of compensation for its clinically active physician workforce and found that neither gender nor part time status affect compensation.

As our hospitals have been recognized nationally, regionally and locally as the recipients of multiple top employer awards, Partners is committed to diversity and inclusion, employee engagement and its measurement, and to our employees.
To deliver on our mission to create new possibilities in medicine to treat serious diseases and improve people's lives, Diversity and Inclusion are core elements of Vertex's global business strategy. Vertex is committed to cultivating an inclusive, high performance environment that values diverse ideas, cultures and experiences. We believe that a diverse and inclusive culture fosters an engaging and productive work environment where every employee can realize his or her full potential. We also believe that diversity brings Vertex broader thinking and creativity, enabling us to better understand and address the needs of current patients and other patients in need of innovative and breakthrough therapies.

We strive to be the industry’s top workplace and employer of choice by attracting, developing and retaining top, diverse talent globally, at all levels and in all areas of expertise to support our business. We also aspire for our leadership to reflect the diverse communities we serve and will serve. Eliminating and avoiding gender wage gaps is a critical aspect of our human resources practices to ensure all employees feel equitably included in our performance-based work culture.

Consistent with our commitment to diversity and inclusion, we regularly analyze various data to ensure that either unrecognized or new wage gaps are quickly addressed in manner eliminates any real or perceived gender disparity. At the senior level, we ensure that we effectively benchmark gender wage data both internally and externally to prevent either initiating or perpetuating a wage gap. In addition, we make extensive investments in early talent pipeline, employee resource groups (including one specifically focusing on developing/supporting women professional), gender-focused development activities and targeted succession planning.

By removing obstacles and creating opportunities for women and others in protected categories, we can continue to model a true culture of inclusion that drives innovation and discovery.
Eastern Bank is deeply committed to advancing social justice where we can affect positive change with and for our communities. Closing the gender wage gap and providing pay equity for women is one such important issue because our communities thrive when everyone, regardless of gender, is able to fulfill their potential and make their strongest contributions.

We know that pay equity is a critical aspect of the value proposition of working at Eastern. It is critical to creating a trusting environment in which people feel fairly treated and can collaborate to best serve our customers. Simply put, it’s table stakes to treat people fairly and compensate them in line with their contributions.

We also understand that there is no easy fix. To achieve full pay equity we must go far beyond paying people equal pay for equal work. There are many, deeply-rooted sources of inequity in pay in Boston. To move forward it’s about pipelining to opportunity. It’s about education. It’s about opening doors and encouraging women and girls to imagine more in career choices. It’s about safe and affordable child care. And many more complex and difficult issues.

Eastern Bank signed the 100% Talent Compact because we believe that closing the gender wage gap is simply the smart and right thing to do, not just as an employer, but as a good corporate citizen in Greater Boston. We were one of the first companies to submit our data to the Boston Women’s Workforce Council because what gets measured, gets improved. We donate time, talent, and treasure to organizations that advance women and girls to achieve their full potential and we advocate for solutions that have the promise to overcome obstacles that are in the way of progress.

We work to be part of the solution. We want to continue to learn from best practices so that we are an attractive employer to talented women and so that more women enter the financial services fields. We know that change will not happen overnight, but if we can take steps forward, progress will come. We actively encourage other companies to join us, to be part of this progress.
We are committed to developing multicultural leaders to their fullest potential, and working with businesses and organizations to build diverse leadership pipelines...With the gender wage gap even larger for women of color, it is especially critical to our mission that we lift up multicultural women and help businesses build work environments where diverse women can thrive. From executive leadership trainings designed to empower diverse professionals, to an extensive alumni network prepared to share best practices and mentorship, The Partnership works every day to arm female professionals and business leaders with the tools and knowledge needed to close the gender wage gap.
As a dynamic asset management firm, Putnam Investments recognizes the uniqueness and diversity of every single individual throughout our organization and industry.

In attracting and retaining talent across many different business disciplines, Putnam understands the need to inspire, motivate and evaluate our associates with regard to productivity, work ethic, innovation and collaboration in a highly objective manner – and ultimately translate these attributes into appropriate compensation levels that ensure equitable pay for equitable service.

Putnam Investments is proud to have been an original signatory of the Boston 100% Talent Compact and a Lead Sponsor of the Boston Women's Workforce Council, which is bringing tremendous leadership in addressing the gender wage-gap issue head-on through organizing some of the city's largest and most influential employers.

The Workforce Council has engaged with forward-thinking companies that understand diverse teams outperform homogeneous ones, and organizations with women in leadership roles are more profitable. As a group, we recognize the unwavering importance of strengthening equal pay laws, building career paths to help women get better paying jobs, increasing the availability of high-quality affordable child care, working to prevent and remedy against maternity leave discrimination, and bolstering the number of women in leadership positions.

Equity in compensation can help to increase worker engagement and productivity – translating to better business outcomes. Additionally, it has the potential to stimulate our economy. But ultimately, it is simply the right thing to do.
“In addition to ensuring pay equity for our employees, MASCO works to attract and retain employees by offering an extensive benefits package, which is an important part of our total compensation philosophy.”

- MARILYN SWARTZ-LLOYD, PRESIDENT AND CEO OF MASCO

See full testimonial on page 27
“We believe that a diverse and inclusive culture fosters an engaging and productive work environment where every employee can realize his or her full potential.”

– MIKE PALLADINO,
SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT, HUMAN RESOURCES,
VERTEX PHARMACEUTICALS INCORPORATED

See full testimonial on page 31
IV. GOING FORWARD: 2017

Members of the BWWC are encouraged by the significant progress made this year, but we know there is much more work to be done. Our top priority is to enable signers of the Compact to be highly successful in their efforts to identify the best practices that have the greatest impact on closing the wage gap. We will do this in two ways: offer forums that enable signers to learn from each other by sharing information, and provide signers with uniquely targeted data and research. The third annual Best Practice Conference is scheduled for September 2017. In addition, the four key issues signers identified in our Best Practices Conference frame the Council's agenda for signers’ workshops throughout coming year: “Creating Internal Goals” - January 2017; “Building the Pipeline and Creating Role Models” - April 2017; “Prioritizing Compensation Transparency” - July 2017; and “Providing Workplace Flexibility” - November 2017.

While we are pleased with the threefold increase in signers this year, we look forward to further increasing the number of Compact signers and ensuring that they are reflective of the Greater Boston economy. Specifically, we seek to create a profile of signers that represents the gender, race, industry and job category composition of the workforce. Council members and signers will be reaching out to their colleagues, business associates and even competitors to recruit more employers to this cause. Our goal is to create such momentum that we turn recruitment into volunteering.

Our third priority for 2017 is to tighten controls to reduce the human error in our reporting process to ensure complete and consistent data reporting particularly as it relates to the racial composition by job category. We will do this without compromising on the unique feature that ensures the anonymity and confidentiality of our data contributors.
V. BOSTON 100% TALENT COMPACT SIGNERS

LEAD SPONSORS:

MassMutual
FINANCIAL GROUP

PARTNERS
HEALTHCARE

100% TALENT
COMPACT SIGNERS:

Abt Associates
Acquia
ABCD
AIM
Allen & Gerritsen
Alosa Health
American Student Assistance
Arlington Advisory Partners
Arrowstreet
Associated General Contractors of Mass
Atwater Wealth Management
Authentic Leadership Institute
Babson College
BBK Worldwide
Bentley University
Big Brothers Big Sisters of Massachusetts Bay
BJ's Wholesale Club
Blue Cross Blue Shield of Massachusetts
Blue Hills Bank
Boston Children's Hospital
Boston Children's Museum
Boston Common Asset Management
Boston Financial Data Services
The Boston Foundation
Boston Magazine
Boston Medical Center
BMC HealthNet Plan
The Boston Newspaper Guild

Boston Private
Boston Public Market
Bright Horizons Family Solutions
Brunner Communications
BSC Group
C.E. Floyd Company, Inc.
Cambridge College
Cantina Consulting
Capital W
Care.com
Carlton PR & Marketing
The Castle Group
CeltiCare Health
Center for Women & Enterprise
Charles Group Consulting
Charlestown Nursery School
The Chiofaro Company
City Fresh Foods
City of Boston
clypd
Colette Phillips Communications
The Commonwealth Institute
Commodore Builders
Community Resource for Justice
Communispace
Consigli Construction
Conventures
Crestwood Advisors
EMPath
Cruz Companies
CTP (Conover Tuttle Pace)
Dana Farber Cancer Institute
Dancing Deer
Dec-Tam Corp
Dimagi, Inc.
The Dimock Center
Done Right Building Services
Dunkin Brands
Eastern Bank
EBS Capstone
Elaine Construction
Elkus Manfredi Architects
EMC Corporation
Empiriko
Eversource
Families for Excellent Schools
FamilyID, Inc.
Federal Reserve Bank Boston
Fiksu
Finagle A Bagel
Flybridge Capital Partners
Girl Scouts of Eastern MA
Goodwin Procter LLP
Goody Clancy
Greater Boston Chamber of Commerce
Greater Boston Food Bank
Green City Growers
Green Schools
The Greenly Group
GZA Geo Environmental, Inc.
Harris Miller Miller & Hanson Inc. (HMMH)
Harvard Pilgrim
Hill Holliday
Hollister Staffing
HouseWorks
HUB International New England
InkHouse
Innovation Nights, LLC
InnoWoman
Institute for Healthcare Improvement
Iron Mountain
JCB Golf, Inc.
Jewish Vocational Service
JLL
John Hancock
Jumpstart for Young Children
Justice Resource Institute
Kelley Chunn & Associates
Kennedy/Jenks Consultants
Kerafast, Inc.
Lantern Financial, LLC
Light Effect Farms
Lindsay Hill Design
Lois L. Lindauer Searches
MA Women’s Political Caucus
Margulies Perruzzi Architects
MASCO
Mass Tech Collaborative
Massachusetts Biotechnology Council
Massachusetts Business Roundtable
Massachusetts Housing and Shelter Alliance
Massachusetts College of Art and Design
Merrimack Pharmaceuticals
Massachusetts Institute of Technology
MORE Advertising
Morgan Memorial Goodwill National Grid
Neighborhood Health Plan
New England Baptist Hospital
Nitsch Engineering
Northeast HR Association (NEHRA)
Nuestra Comunidad
The Partnership PharmaLogics Recruiting
Pinck & Co, Inc.
The Pine Street Inn
Posternak Blankstein & Lund LLP
Quality Interactions, Inc.
reachHIRE
Rose Kennedy Greenway Conservancy
Roxbury Tech
RSM US LLP
Second Time Around
SEIU 888
Shawmut Design and Construction
Shorelight Education
Simmons College
Sixt Rent a Car
Social Finance
St. Anthony Shrine
Staples, Inc.
Suffolk Construction
Suffolk University
Sun Life Financial
Sustainability Roundtable, Inc.
Tech Networks of Boston
Tokai Pharmaceuticals
Top It Off
Trillium Asset Management, LLC
Tufts Health Plan
Turningpoint Communications
Valore
Vanasse Hangen Brustlin (VHB)
Verc Car Rental
Version 2.0 Communications
Vinfen
The WAGE Project
Weber Shandwick
Webster Bank
Wentworth Institute of Technology
Wheelock College
Willis Towers Watson
WORK Inc.
Woodard & Curran New England
YMCA of Greater Boston
YW Boston